The Role of Government in Supporting Affordable Housing

Workshop on Appropriate Government Role in U.S. Mortgage Markets

Jane Dokko April 27, 2017

Rationale for Government Role

Very reasonable to think that canonical economic motivations for government intervention — externalities, market failure, paternalism — apply to housing affordability for renters & buyers

- Agglomeration benefits & mobility vis-à-vis markets with high housing costs & supply constraints
- Environment
- Asymmetric information in mortgage market
- Imperfect observability of housing quality
- Shelter necessary for human survival
- And so on …

Some Challenges for Policy Design

- Many ways to define housing affordability for renters & buyers
- Limited evidence on scale & scope of the problem that justifies government intervention (& distortions)
- Misalignment between desired economic outcomes & effectiveness of existing policy tools
- Mistrust in market forces to improve affordability
- Politics & special interest groups

3 Treasury "Issue Briefs" (2016-2017)

- Frame Obama Administration's principles for GSE reform in context of affordability
 - In particular, "broad access to affordable mortgages and rents" for creditworthy buyers & renters in framework with risk-based pricing, competition, taxpayer protections
- Marker for accomplishments enhancing affordability
 - 4.2 bps & HTF/CMF, FHFA duty-to-serve, national loss-mitigation standards

Tradeoffs & Uncertainty

- Policymakers lack framework for understanding & evaluating tradeoffs for achieving competing goals
 - Risk-based pricing versus "cross-subsidization" (viewed as affordability tool)
 - Private capital versus ending taxpayer bailouts
 - Enhancing affordability versus reducing government subsidies
- Range of institutional designs across GSE reform proposals make this more challenging
- Uncertainty in knowing what works is also an impediment