1. The ARRC Chair welcomed Federal Reserve Board of Governors Vice Chair for Supervision Randal Quarles and Federal Reserve Bank of New York President John Williams. Vice Chair Quarles congratulated the ARRC on its achievements to date, underscored the Federal Reserve’s ongoing support for the ARRC's work, and stressed that market participants should continue to work to ensure an effective, timely transition away from LIBOR.

President Williams noted that the existence of LIBOR is not guaranteed beyond end-2021 and that ARRC members must do everything possible to prepare for a future without LIBOR and to ensure that the financial industry is focused on preparing for that risk. President Williams urged those market participants that are lagging behind in transitioning away from LIBOR to accelerate their efforts. President Williams added that SOFR is important to the transition and that while efforts to develop a forward-looking term rate are ongoing, in most cases an average of SOFR is a suitable alternative to a term rate.

2. Representatives from the U.S. Treasury Department provided an overview of their recently released regulatory relief proposal that aims to reduce the potential adverse tax consequences that could arise when financial contracts are amended to replace IBORs with alternative reference rates such as SOFR. The Chair of the ARRC’s Accounting/Tax working group noted that Treasury’s proposal was very useful to the transition and that the working group plans to submit a detailed response. The Treasury representatives encouraged the ARRC, member firms, and other market participants to provide feedback during the public comment period, which ends on November 25, 2019.

3. Federal Reserve staff delivered a presentation (Attachment 1) showing that while SOFR futures volumes have grown significantly since inception, current market depth and trading volumes significantly lag fed funds futures and do not yet appear sufficient to create a robust IOSCO-compliant SOFR term rate. The ARRC Chair noted that members should focus on bringing more trading volumes into SOFR derivatives and cash markets in order to make the development of a futures-derived term rate more viable. The co-Chair of the ARRC’s Term Rate working group and ARRC members discussed other metrics and markets that the ARRC could consider in order to determine a sufficient level of liquidity in SOFR futures to develop a term rate. Federal Reserve staff noted their presentation reflected a preliminary analysis for members to consider and that the Committee would have the opportunity to develop its own criteria for judging the level of SOFR futures liquidity that would be adequate for creating a robust IOSCO-compliant SOFR term rate.

4. ARRC members discussed ways that the Committee could enlist outside resources to amplify its outreach and communications efforts to more effectively reach a wider audience impacted by the LIBOR transition. Members highlighted the need to ensure that market participants and the general public have an accurate understanding of the ARRC’s work on promoting and coordinating the transition to SOFR and away from LIBOR.

5. The ARRC approved recommended fallback contract language for closed-end, residential adjustable-rate mortgages (ARMs), which was subsequently released. The recommended language for use in new ARM contracts incorporates feedback received during an extended public consultation period as well as input from the ARRC’s Consumer Products working group, which is made up of a wide range of market participants, including consumer advocacy groups.
6. The ARRC’s antitrust counsel updated the Committee about its outreach to the Antitrust Division of the Department of Justice to express support for the International Swaps and Derivatives Association (ISDA) with respect to the its Business Review Letter (BRL) request.

The co-Chairs of the ARRC’s Legal working group noted that ARRC working-group members were coalescing around a consensus approach in continuing to explore potential legislative relief for certain legacy USD LIBOR-linked products. The co-Chairs also provided an overview of the legislative process if the Committee decides to move forward with pursuing a potential legislative approach. Finally, an ARRC member highlighted the approaches that a subgroup of ARRC members will take to analyze the potential impact on markets that could result from a permanent cessation of LIBOR in the absence of a legislative solution. The ARRC Chair noted that depending on the progress made in these efforts in the ensuing weeks, the Committee may consider convening a telephonic ARRC meeting to decide whether it is appropriate to begin engaging externally on potential legislative relief.

7. The ARRC Chair closed the meeting by reiterating that the opening remarks by Vice Chairman Quarles and President Williams indicated that the Committee has the full support of the official sector and must remain focused on pushing the transition forward.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Attendees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>American Bankers Association</td>
<td>Hu Benton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AXA</td>
<td>Julien Zusslin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bank of America</td>
<td>Alex van Voorhees*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bank of America</td>
<td>Greg Todd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bank of America</td>
<td>Sonali Theisen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BlackRock</td>
<td>Jack Hattem*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citigroup</td>
<td>Dina Faenson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citigroup</td>
<td>Jeannine Hyman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CME Group</td>
<td>Agha Mirza</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CME Group</td>
<td>Fred Sturm*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRE Finance Council</td>
<td>Lisa Pendergast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRE Finance Council</td>
<td>Raj Aidasani</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deutsche Bank</td>
<td>Vishal Mahadkar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fannie Mae</td>
<td>Bob Ives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fannie Mae</td>
<td>Thomas Garan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fannie Mae</td>
<td>Wells Engledow*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal Home Loan Bank</td>
<td>Kyle Lynch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal Home Loan Bank</td>
<td>Phil Scott</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freddie Mac</td>
<td>Ameez Nanjee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GE Capital</td>
<td>Michael Taets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goldman Sachs</td>
<td>Brian Friedman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goldman Sachs</td>
<td>Gigi Chavez de Arnavat*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goldman Sachs</td>
<td>Guillaume Helie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goldman Sachs</td>
<td>Jason Granet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goldman Sachs</td>
<td>Richard Chambers *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government Finance Officers Association</td>
<td>Emily Brock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government Finance Officers Association</td>
<td>Pat McCoy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSBC</td>
<td>Blair Selber</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSBC</td>
<td>Shirley Hapangama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent Community Bankers of America</td>
<td>Chris Cole*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent Community Bankers of America</td>
<td>James Kendrick*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intercontinental Exchange</td>
<td>Harvey Flax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Swaps and Derivatives Association</td>
<td>Ann Battle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JP Morgan Chase &amp; Co.</td>
<td>Alice Wang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JP Morgan Chase &amp; Co.</td>
<td>David Beck</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JP Morgan Chase &amp; Co.</td>
<td>Emilio Jimenez</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JP Morgan Chase &amp; Co.</td>
<td>Katie Morgan*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JP Morgan Chase &amp; Co.</td>
<td>Keith Stephan*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JP Morgan Chase &amp; Co.</td>
<td>Matthew Cherwin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JP Morgan Chase &amp; Co.</td>
<td>Perry Elbadrawi*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JP Morgan Chase &amp; Co.</td>
<td>Terry Belton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LCH</td>
<td>Phil Whitehurst*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loan Syndications and Trading Association</td>
<td>Meredith Coffey</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Loan Syndications and Trading Association  
Tess Virmani*  
MetLife  
Alex Strickler*  
MetLife  
Jason Manske  
MetLife  
Kevin Budd*  
Morgan Stanley  
Maria Douvas-Orme  
Morgan Stanley  
Matt Ochs  
Morgan Stanley  
Paige Mandy  
Morgan Stanley  
Tom Wipf  
National Association of Corporate Treasurers  
Tom Deas  
Pacific Investment Management Company  
Courtney Garcia*  
Pacific Investment Management Company  
Scott Goodman*  
Pacific Investment Management Company  
Tracey Jordal  
Prudential Financial  
Chris McAlister  
Prudential Financial  
Gary Horbacz  
Securities Industry and Financial Markets Association  
Chris Killian  
Securities Industry and Financial Markets Association  
Rob Toomey*  
Structured Finance Association  
Sairah Burki*  
TD Bank  
Greg Moore  
TD Bank  
Priya Misra*  
Wells Fargo  
Alexis Pederson  
Wells Fargo  
Brian Grabenstein  
Wells Fargo  
Susan Hughes  
World Bank Group  
Don Sinclair*  

Ex-Officio ARRC Members  
Commodity Futures Trading Commission  
Joshua Sterling*  
Commodity Futures Trading Commission  
Sayee Srinivasan*  
Consumer Financial Protection Bureau  
Abhishek Agarwal  
Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation  
Irina Leonova  
Federal Housing Finance Agency  
Dan Coates  
Federal Reserve Bank of New York  
Adhiraj Dutt  
Federal Reserve Bank of New York  
Betsy Bourassa  
Federal Reserve Bank of New York  
Caren Cox  
Federal Reserve Bank of New York  
Jamie Pfeifer  
Federal Reserve Bank of New York  
John Williams  
Federal Reserve Bank of New York  
Justine Hansen  
Federal Reserve Bank of New York  
Matt Lieber  
Federal Reserve Bank of New York  
Megan Zirinsky*  
Federal Reserve Bank of New York  
Nathaniel Wuerffel  
Federal Reserve Bank of New York  
Ray Check  
Federal Reserve Bank of New York  
Scott Nagel  
Federal Reserve Board of Governors  
Chiara Scotti*  
Federal Reserve Board of Governors  
Darren Gersh*  
Federal Reserve Board of Governors  
David Bowman  
Federal Reserve Board of Governors  
Erfan Danesh
Federal Reserve Board of Governors  
Erik Heitfield

Federal Reserve Board of Governors  
Evan Winerman*

Federal Reserve Board of Governors  
Jeff Huther

Federal Reserve Board of Governors  
Randal Quarles*

Office of Financial Research  
Matt McCormick*

Office of the Comptroller of the Currency  
Christopher McBride*

Office of the Comptroller of the Currency  
Kevin Walsh*

U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission  
Jason Leung

U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission  
Michelle Danis*

U.S. Treasury  
Brett York*

U.S. Treasury  
Chloe Cabot

U.S. Treasury  
Peter Phelan

Observers

Bank of Canada  
Sheryl King*

BNP Paribas  
Simon Winn

Brunswick Group  
Alex Masi*

Brunswick Group  
Jeanmarie McFadden

Brunswick Group  
Kaylan Normandeau*

Brunswick Group  
Mathilde Milch

Brunswick Group  
Mustafa Riffat

Cadwalader  
Jonathan Hoff

Cadwalader  
Lary Stromfeld

Deloitte  
Alexey Surkov

Ernst & Young  
John Boyle

Morgan Lewis  
Jon Roellke*

Oliver Wyman  
Adam Schneider

U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development  
Carol Vilsack*

U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development  
Jose Fernandez

U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development  
Richard Perrelli*

*Indicates participation by telephone
Futures Market Trading Volume and SOFR Term Rates

Danesh, Heitfield, and Park
Research and Statistics Division, Federal Reserve Board

October 22, 2019

Disclaimer: The views expressed in this presentation are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of the Federal Reserve, the Alternative Reference Rates Committee or its members or ex officio members.
Forward-looking term rates

- Term rates derived from SOFR derivatives can provide well-behaved benchmark rates.
  - ARRC Second Report
  - Heitfield and Park
  - Salem, Younger, and St. John

- But the robustness of such rates depends on the depth of underlying derivatives markets.
- Limited futures market depth risks SOFR term rates that may be
  - overly volatile or inconsistent with other market term rates
  - sensitive to spurious trades and/or subject to manipulation

This information is provided for illustrative and educational purposes only. The views expressed in this presentation are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the Federal Reserve, the Alternative Reference Rates Committee or its members or ex officio members.
SOFR futures volumes have been growing

This information is provided for illustrative and educational purposes only. The views expressed in this presentation are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the Federal Reserve, the Alternative Reference Rates Committee or its members or ex officio members.
SOFR and FF futures volumes since June

Notional Volume
From Jun 03, 2019 to Oct 16, 2019

This information is provided for illustrative and educational purposes only. The views expressed in this presentation are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the Federal Reserve, the Alternative Reference Rates Committee or its members or ex officio members.
Even FF futures volumes have been lower in the past

This information is provided for illustrative and educational purposes only. The views expressed in this presentation are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the Federal Reserve, the Alternative Reference Rates Committee or its members or ex officio members.
Distribution of FF futures daily volume since 2005

Daily Notional Volume Frequency for Federal Funds Futures
From Jan 03, 2005 to Oct 16, 2019

This information is provided for illustrative and educational purposes only. The views expressed in this presentation are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the Federal Reserve, the Alternative Reference Rates Committee or its members or ex officio members.
Volume is concentrated in near-term contracts

- The derivation of 1-month term rate relies on 1-month futures contracts maturing within two months and the first 3-month contract.
- The derivation of 6-month term rate depends on 1-month contracts maturing in less than seven months and the first three 3-month contracts.

Average Daily Notional Volume by Contract Month

This information is provided for illustrative and educational purposes only. The views expressed in this presentation are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the Federal Reserve, the Alternative Reference Rates Committee or its members or ex officio members.
For some contracts, few or no trades may be observed.

Trades/Day for 3-Month-Ahead Contract

Trade Count Frequency – Fed Funds Futures
Data from past 6 months

Trade Count Frequency – 1M SOFR Futures
Data from past 6 months

This information is provided for illustrative and educational purposes only. The views expressed in this presentation are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the Federal Reserve, the Alternative Reference Rates Committee or its members or ex officio members.
The available depth is orders of magnitude larger for Federal Funds futures compared to SOFR futures.

Federal Funds Futures (Lead Contract, Date Range: May 2018–Oct 2019)

1–Month SOFR Futures (Lead Contract, Date Range: May 2018–Oct 2019)

This information is provided for illustrative and educational purposes only. The views expressed in this presentation are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the Federal Reserve, the Alternative Reference Rates Committee or its members or ex officio members.
Limit Order Book Depth

- Liquidity is not evenly distributed among different expiries.

Federal Funds Futures

1–Month SOFR Futures

Date Range: May 2018 - Oct 2019

This information is provided for illustrative and educational purposes only. The views expressed in this presentation are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the Federal Reserve, the Alternative Reference Rates Committee or its members or ex officio members.
Kyle’s $\lambda$ is a standard measure of price impact.  
$\lambda$ is calculated from the regression:

$$Return_t = \lambda \times \text{Aggregate Trade}_t + \epsilon_t$$

where

$$\text{Aggregate Trade}_t = \sum_{i=1}^{M} \text{Sign}(\text{Trade}_i) \times |\text{Trade Volume}_i|$$

$$\text{Return}_t = \log(\text{Close Price}_{5-min,t}) - \log(\text{Close Price}_{5-min,t-1}).$$
Currently, SOFR futures are a lot more susceptible to large trades than Federal Funds futures.

The price impact for the federal funds futures was much larger during the zero-lower-bound period.
Conclusions

- We should exercise caution in moving to futures-implied term rates until daily SOFR futures volumes and liquidity build further.
- Trading volumes in short-term rate futures may not remain at their currently relatively high levels.
  - During the 2010-15 zero-lower-bound period FF futures volumes were much lower than they are today.
Conclusions

- With regard to benchmark robustness, the IOSCO principles embed a sense of proportionality – the more widely a reference rate is used, the more robust it needs to be.
  - Increasing use of existing SOFR rates should support SOFR futures and OIS volumes, making term rates more robust.
  - Limiting use of term rates to specific areas (i.e., fallbacks and certain loan contracts as suggested by the ARRC and the FSB) should help to allow the term rate to be produced more quickly. Wider use of term rates would require a commensurately more robust rate and would postpone the time at which the necessary market depth could be achieved.
- IOSCO compliance involves meeting governance, benchmark quality, methodological quality, and accountability principles, in addition to being based on an adequate transactional base.